

Study Tour

2016 February

Uganda Social Protection

The Government of the Republic of Uganda (GoU) designed the national planning framework 'Vision 2040', aiming at transforming the Ugandan society from a low-income to a modern and prosperous upper middle-income country with an average per capita income of USD9,500 within 30 years.

The GoU has been implementing phase one of the Expanding Social Protection (ESP) Programme since 2010. The overall objective of the ESP is to create a national social protection system that benefits the poorest, as a core element of the country's national planning and budgeting process.

The programme comprises two main components: (1) policy support focusing on strengthening leadership on social protection across different levels of the government, developing a consolidated national social protection policy, generating evidence on the impacts of social protection, and building government commitment to and investment in social protection, including strengthening institutional capacities; and (2) a pilot cash transfer programme (Social Assistance Grants for Empowerment–SAGE).

The Ugandan Ministry of Gender, Labour and Social Development (MGLSD) has effectively implemented the SAGE pilot, generating evidence on potential impacts and administrative feasibility.

Following the successful implementation of phase one of the ESP Programme, the GoU has reached a clear vision for a comprehensive national social protection system. In line with this vision, the MGLSD has formulated a National Social Protection Policy (NSPP) to guide the establishment of a national social protection system that will be pivotal to sustaining poverty reduction, reducing inequality and maximising human capital development and social cohesion during the forthcoming socio-economic transformation.

Under the NSPP, the MGLSD will lead the implementation of the Direct Income Support programmes and develop systems to better coordinate social protection interventions in the country.

Objective of the Study Tour

In preparation for the implementation of the NSPP, the MGLSD planned to conduct a study tour for senior technical officers to learn more about the social protection system of Brazil, a country seen as a model for social development.

The purpose of this study tour was to prepare the MGLSD to effectively lead and foster inter-sectoral coordination of social protection interventions as well as start the process of influencing key sector stakeholders. Therefore, the members of the delegation expressed interest in learning from the implementation and coordination of systems under the scope of social development programmes led by the Brazilian Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger (MDS), most notably the Bolsa Família Programme, the Brazil without Extreme Poverty plan and the Single Registry System.







Members of the Delegation:

The visiting delegation was composed of the following senior technical officers from key ministries of the GoU.

- 1. Mr. Pius Bigirimana: Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Gender, Labour & Social Development (MGLSD) and head of the delegation;
- 2. Ms. Jane S. Mpagi: Director, Gender and Community Development, MGLSD;
- 3. Mr. Kenneth Mugambe: Director, Budget, Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development;
- 4. Mr. Paul Okot Okello: Commissioner, Local Government Administration, Ministry of Local Government;
- 5. **Dr. Sarah Byakika:** Commissioner, Ministry of Health;
- 6. **Dr. Patrick Birungi:** Director, Planning, National Planning Authority;

- 7. Ms. Ketty Lamaro: Undersecretary in Charge of Pacification and Development in Northern Uganda, Office of the Prime Minister;
- 8. Mr. James Ebitu: Programme Manager, Youth Livelihood Programme (YLP), MGLSD;
- 9. Ms. Beatrice Okillan: Policy and Learning Manager, Expanding Social Protection (ESP) Programme;
- 10. Mr. David Lambert Tumwesigye:
 Policy and Advocacy Advisor, ESP Programme;
- 11. Ms. Caroline Kego Laker: Social Development Advisor, Irish AID Uganda;
- 12. Ms. Irene Among: Social Development Advisor, DFID Uganda.

SPEAKERS BIOGRAPHY

Niky Fabiancic

Niky is the Resident Coordinator of the United Nations System and the Resident Representative of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) in Brazil since October 2015, and the Director of the IPC-IG. An Argentinian national, Niky Fabiancic holds a Master's Degree in Computer Science and Telecommunications from the Brooklyn Polytechnic University, New York, and a Bachelor's Degree in Electrical and Electronic Engineering from the University of Mendonza, Argentina. During his 30-year career with the United Nations, Niky Fabiancic has held such positions: Resident Coordinator of the United Nations System and Resident Representative of the UNDP in Venezuela; Deputy Administrative Assistant and Deputy Regional Director for the Latin America and the Caribbean region of the UNDP in New York; Resident Coordinator of the United Nations System and Resident Representative of the UNDP in the Dominican Republic; Deputy Resident Representative of the UNDP in Venezuela; Chief of Staff to the Director of the Development Group in New York; and Information Management Director for the UNDP Information Management Service Department.

Fábio Veras Soares

Fábio holds a Ph.D. from University College London – UCL (2004) as well as a Master's degree in Economics from the University of São Paulo (1999) and a B.A degree in Economics from the University of Brasília (1993). He is currently the Communications, Publications and Research Coordinator of the IPC-IG (UNDP). He is on leave from the Institute for Applied Economic Research (Ipea), Brasília. He has worked with impact evaluation of cash transfers and other social programmes in countries such as Brazil, Paraguay, Mozambique and Yemen. He had had his work published in the Journal of Development Effectiveness and the Latin America Research Review, and has written book chapters on the comparative analysis of cash transfer programmes. He has numerous publications on impact evaluation of cash transfers and social protection programmes, public policies and labour economics.

Luis Henrique Paiva

Luis Henrique holds a B.A in Sociology from the Federal University of Minas Gerais (1992), as well as a Ph.D. in Sociology and Politics from the same institution. He also holds a Masters in Sociology (Federal University of Campinas—Unicamp,

1995) and Social Policies (University of Southampton, 2009). A permanent civil servant for the Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management, Luis Henrique has extensive experience working at the Ministry of Social Security, Labour and Social Development and Fight Against Hunger (MDS), where he served as advisor, national secretary and assistant national secretary for the Bolsa Família Programme. He was recently seconded to the Institute for applied Economic Research (Ipea). Working with the Institute's Directorate of Studies and Economic Relations and International Policies (DINTE), he collaborates with the IPC-IG in joint projects between both institutions.

Rafael Guerreiro Osório

Rafael is a sociologist who does research on poverty, inequality and social stratification, including gender and ethnic/ racial inequalities, and their inter linkages with social policies. He has extensive experience as an advisor in policy design, monitoring and evaluation, and in communicating evaluation/research results to policymakers and other stakeholders. His main institutional affiliation is the Institute for Applied Economic Research (Ipea). Currently, he is a Research Coordinator at the International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth. Before joining the IPC-IG for the second time, he worked as the advisor to the Chief Minister of Strategic Affairs of the Presidency of the Republic (2014-15); as Ipea's Director of Social Studies and Policies (DISOC—2012-2014); and as Ipea's Coordinator of Studies on Social Security, Assistance, Poverty and Inequality (2011-2012). From 2004 to 2009, he was a UNDP Researcher and Data Manager at the IPC-IG. From 2000 to 2004, he worked as a consultant for international organisations such as the UNDP, the World Bank, the ILO and DFID, as well as for many institutions of the Brazilian Government. He has also represented Ipea in the Brazilian National Council Against Discrimination (2003); was one of the main contributors of the Brazilian 2005 Human Development Report on Racism, Poverty and Violence; was the technical coordinator of the V Brazilian National MDG Monitoring Report (2014); and rapporteur for MDG 1 of the IV Brazilian National Report (2010). He recently led the IPC team responsible for designing the proposal for a Cash Transfer Programme in Cape Verde and is now leading other policy applied research projects at the IPC-IG, thoroughly involved with the discussions on the SDGs.

Alicia Spengler

Alicia is a German national, and holds a Master's degree in Politics and Economics from the University of Cologne, with a focus on the Latin American Region and a post-graduation in HR management as well as further courses in IT Management and Strategic Sustainable Development. She is an ICTI4D specialist with ten years of experience in programming, particularly in research and pilot projects. She has worked with a range of stakeholders, including: Government Ministries, the private sector, international and local NGOS, MFI and Credit Cooperatives, academic research centres and policy think tanks. Her technical areas of expertise include social protection, financial inclusion, community development and digital payment systems. Alicia has worked in different development and emerging countries in Latin America. She is fluent in German, English, Portuguese and Spanish. At the IPC-IG Alicia works as a Project Analyst and is mainly responsible for the execution of the Social Protection Knowledge Sharing Gateway project, financed by the Australian Government.

Daniel Ximenes

Daniel holds a Master's and a Ph.D. in Sociology from the University of Brasília (2001), where he developed research in the area of Policy Evaluation for Higher Education policies. Recently, he worked at the University of California as a Postdoctoral Fellow (Davis, 2014-2015). Daniel is a permanent civil servant for the Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management with expertise in Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E), especially in education and multi-sectoral collaboration policies. He worked with M&E at the Brazilian Ministry of Education (MEC) and at the National Institute for Education Research (INEP). Moreover, Daniel was the Coordinator for the Institutional Evaluation Area at the Methodist University of Piracicaba—UNIMEP (1999 to 2002). Since 2006, Daniel's research has focused on social policy and education, as he worked as an Advisor for the Presidency of the Republic (Casa Civil) and later as a Director for the Educational Vulnerabilities Research Department at MEC. From June 2011 to May 2015, Daniel was the Director of the Conditionalities Department for the Bolsa Família Programme, and later worked as a Programme Director for the Executive Department at MEC. Currently, Daniel is the General Coordinator for Basic Education Professionals' Development, at DEB/CAPES (Coordination for the Improvement of Higher Education Professionals).

Denise do Carmo Direito

Denise do Carmo Direito holds a Master's Degree in Political Science from the University of Brasilia (UnB) and a Bachelor's Degree in Social Communications from the same institution, majoring in Journalism and Advertising. She worked in the

private sector and currently works in the specialty field of public policies and government management, acting as a General Coordinator at the Brazilian Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger (MDS). Ms. Direito has professional experience in the areas of social communications and political science, more specifically in public policy, with an emphasis on the following topics: public policy, federal coordination, intersectoral coordination, democracy and participation, struggle for recognition and non-hegemonic cultures.

Marcelo Abi-Ramia Caetano

Marcelo Caetano works for the Institute for Applied Economic Research (Ipea, Brazil) since 1997. He is a member of the Journal of Social Policy editorial council, from Cambridge University Press. He holds a B.A in Economics from the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro—UFRJ and a Ph.D. in Economics from the Castelo Branco University—UCB. Marcelo started his professional career as a University Professor for Macroeconomics at the Federal Fluminense University—UFF and the Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro (PUC-Rio) during the 1990s. From 1998 until 2005, Marcelo worked as the Coordinator for Accountability and Technical Studies at the Ministry of Social Security and Labour (Brazil) and in 2009 he worked as a visiting professor at the London School of Economics—LSE (United Kingdom). Since 1997, Marcelo's main working area is social security, having had his work published in numerous international publications in the United States, the UK, Switzerland, Portugal, Chile and Mexico. Among his highest achievements, Marcelo has developed a Fiscal Impact Analysis of social insurance reforms in Brazil, Equator and Cape Verde. Since 2002, he has worked as the coordinator for Ipea's Social Insurance Research Department.

Marcelo de Sousa

Marcelo holds a Master's in Political Sociology and a Ph.D. in Sociology of Labour from the University of Brasília (UnB). Since 2001, he is a permanent civil servant for the Ministry of Planning, Budget and Management, and has accrued extensive experience working for the Brazilian Ministry of Labour (MTE) as both Executive Department Advisor (2001-2002) and as General Coordinator for the Qualifications Department (2003-2008). He is currently seconded to the Ministry of Social Development and Fight Against Hunger (MDS), where he has worked with Productive Inclusion in *Bolsa Família* (National Secretariat for Citizenship Income—SENARC, 2008-2011). Since 2011, Marcelo is the Special Advisor at the Department for Productive Inclusion in Urban Areas, where he is responsible for coordinating productive inclusion projects within the Brasil Sem Miséria programme—such as professional qualification, workforce intermediation, microcredit, entrepreneurship and solidary economy.

Rodrigo Orair

Rodrigo holds a B.A with Honours in Economics from the University of Minas Gerais – UFMG (2002), and a Master's degree in Economics from the State University of Campinas – Unicamp (2006). Rodrigo is a researcher for the Institute for Applied Economic Research (Ipea, Brazil), and currently seconded to the IPC-IG. Rodrigo is an expert on macroeconomics and public finances, having published many studies on topics related to public spending and taxing at central and local government' levels, as well as on the relationship between such patterns of public finances and the overall development of the country. These technical studies have been required by several Brazilian public institutions, such as Ipea, the Ministry of Finance and the Federal Court of Accounts (TCU).

Raphaella Bandeira

Raphaella holds a B.A in International Relations from the University of Brasília (UnB). Since 2010, she is a permanent civil servant for the Ministry of Social Development and Fight Against Hunger (MDS) working as an Analyst for Social Policies. Raphaella currently works with International Technical Cooperation projects, mainly related to extreme poverty eradication, education and financial inclusion of low-income populations.

Pedro Lara de Arruda

Pedro holds a B.A. with Honours in International Relations from the University of Brasília (UnB—2009) and a Master's Degree in International Relations from Jawaharlal Nehru University, India (2012). He is a specialist in social policies and programmes of the Global South, focusing on South-South cooperation. He has been a researcher at the IPC-IG since 2013. During this time, he has taken a number of research related roles, including technical support for constructing social programmes

in African countries, guest-editing and authoring IPC-IG publications, providing technical assistance to study tours, and proactively negotiating research agreements with key partners in the context of the BRICS and IBSA initiatives. Before joining the Centre, Pedro was a researcher at UnB's Centre for Asian Studies-Neasia/CEAM (2010-13), a CEO for consultancy on social policies for Asian countries at the firm BRICS-PED (2012-13), a collaborator at the Argentinian Centre for International Studies – CAEI (2010-12) and of the Laboratory of Asian Studies of the University of São Paulo–LEA-USP (2010-12), and a researcher for a UnB project on IBSA, funded by the Ford Foundation (2007-10).

AGENDA

The Uganda Social Protection Study Tour composed of a series of meetings with experts touching upon many aspects of the Brazilian social protection system. The majority of the experts were from the Brazilian Institute for Applied Economic Research (Ipea). Researchers from Ipea perform monitoring and evaluation, and advise decision makers in the Brazilian Government; many of them also have direct experience in managing social programmes, and have held official positions in the government.

The study tour reserved one day for a field visit to units of the Social Assistance Reference Centre (CRAS) and Specialised Social Assistance Reference Centre (CREAS). Meetings were planned over the span of four days, with two sessions in the morning and one in the afternoon—totalling 12 encounters with experts.

Monday Feb 22	Tuesday Feb 23	Wednesday Feb 24	Thursday Feb 25	Friday Feb 26
Opening Remarks Mr. Niky Fabiancic - UN Resident Coordinator/ UNDP Residente Representative/ IPC-IG Director Clarification of learning objectives and expectations Mr. Pius Bigirimana - Ministry of Gender Labour and Social Development - Uganda Overview of Brazil's Social	Brazil's Social Security Programmes - Contributory Pension System Mr. Marcelo Caetano - Ipea	Brasil Sem Miséria Programme: Overview, Interagency Coordination for BSM Ms. Raphaella Bandeira - MDS	Brasil Sem Miséria Programme: Coordination between social assistance, education and health policies. Mr. Daniel Ximenes - DEB/Capes(I*)	Field Visit (I*) CRAS (Social Assistance Reference Centre) - Location: Ceilândia Sul CREAS (Specialized Social Assistance Reference Centre) - Location: Ceilândia
Protection System Mr. Luis Henrique Paiva - IPC-IG/Ipea				
Interagency Coordination in Social Protection: Institutions and Politics - Ms. Luciana Jaccoud - Ipea (I*)	Brazil's Social Security Programmes - Non-Contributory Pension System Mr. Rafael Osório - IPC-IG/Ipea	Brasil Sem Miséria Programme: the strategy for rural povery, institutonal food procurement and subsidies targeted at smallholders famers Mr. Fábio Veras - IPC-IG/Ipea	Brasil Sem Miséria Programme: targeted conditional cash transfers, Bolsa Família in depth Mr. Luis Henrique Paiva - IPC-IG/Ipea	
Interagency Coordination in Social Protection: Cadastro Único (Single Registry) and other registy for social programme Ms. Denise Direito - MDS	Financing the Brazilian Social Protection System Mr. Rodrigo Orair - IPC-IG/Ipea	Brasil Sem Miséria Programme: the strategy for urban poverty, vocational education and trainnig Mr. Marcelo Sousa - MDS	Brasil Sem Miséria Programme: interagency coordination with the housing programme Minha Casa, Minha Vida Mr. Pedro Arruda - IPC-IG/Ipea	
	Social Protection Gateway & IPC-IG Presentation Ms. Alicia Spengler - IPC-IG and Mr. Rafael Osório - IPC-IG/Ipea		Debriefing and post-tour action planning session (TBC)	

⁽I*) Simultaneous interpretation was available.







SUMMARY OF THE SESSIONS

Day 1: 22 February 2016

SESSION 1: Overview of the Brazilian Social Protection System

Speaker: Mr. Luis Henrique Paiva, IPC-IG Research Associate and Ipea Researcher

Mr. Paiva presented the opening session of the Uganda Study Tour, providing a baseline for the following sessions. He presented a comprehensive overview of the social protection system in Brazil, focusing on relevant developments such as the approval of a new Federal Constitution in 1988; the creation of the Single Registry (*Cadastro Único*) and the *Bolsa Família* Programme during the early 2000s, and the enactment of the Brazil without Extreme Poverty (*Brasil Sem Miséria*) strategy in 2011.

He explained the institutional framework surrounding social assistance benefits and used quantitative studies to illustrate how the *Bolsa Família* and *Brasil Sem Miséria* programmes have impacted poverty reduction in Brazil over the last decade.

At the end of the session, different members from the Ugandan delegation asked questions about social protection in Brazil, e.g.: "How do large-scale cash transfers such as the *Bolsa Família* programme obtain consensus from different political parties"? "How has the programme achieved such high approval in the public eye?" The IPC-IG team explained that the consolidation of a monitoring and evaluation system that supports government accountability has been essential for the programme's success. Also, the far-reaching political support from the ruling Labour Party during the establishment of *Bolsa Família* was regarded as a positive factor for the consolidation of the programme.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/p3Nl00eJXJj38m

Additional reading material:

One Pager: From *Bolsa Família* to *Brasil Sem Miséria*: a Summary of Brazil's Recent Journey towards Overcoming Extreme Poverty http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager228.pdf

Working Paper: Poverty, Inequality and Social Policies in Brazil, 1995-2009 http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCWorkingPaper87.pdf

One Pager: Social Policies and the Fall in Inequality in Brazil: Achievements and Challenges http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager135.pdf>

SESSION 2: cancelled

SESSION 3: Interagency Coordination in Social Protection—*Cadastro Único* (Single Registry) and other registries for social programmes

Speaker: Ms. Denise do Carmo, General Coordinator, National Secretariat for Citizenship Income, MDS

Ms. Denise do Carmo explained the functioning of Brazil's Single Registry (*Cadastro Único*—CadÚnico), the main instrument used by the Brazilian Government to register low-income families in social programmes. The Single Registry is considered a

remarkable tool due to its scale: there are currently 26.6 million families enrolled in the registry database, which is constantly being updated by social workers at the local level.

The presentation focused on both the effectiveness and the weaknesses of the instrument, sharing lessons learned from the Single Registry, potential points of improvement and possible adaptations to other country contexts. The presentation highlighted that the Single Registry's main registration form features the same categories of questions as the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics (IBGE) uses in its nationwide population censuses, which are conducted every ten years. In fact, the convergence of information across both instruments is crucial for the effective monitoring and evaluation of different social protection programmes

Ms. do Carmo shared important indicators based on the collection of data for the Single Registry and the government's experiences with ensuring data quality. The availability of up-to-date and qualified data about people living in poverty is essential for the effectiveness of targeting systems, which ensure that families receiving the benefit are the ones who need it the most. This point was of special interest to the representative of Uganda's Ministry of Internal Affairs, as most developing countries suffer from restricted financial resources and reducing poverty mainly depends on efficient targeting measures. Towards the end of her presentation, Ms. do Carmo provided a few examples of the Brazilian experience with inter-agency coordination in social protection, highlighting that the operational model designed for a system such as the Single Registry varies according to different country specificities.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/u40FjUorwa9rBS

Additional reading material:

One Pager: Socio-economic Profile of Programa *Bolsa Família* Recipients: What Does the Single Registry Reveal? http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager240.pdf

Working Paper: *Cadastro Único*: a Registry Supported by a National Public Bank http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCWorkingPaper126.pdf>

One Pager: Cadastro Único: a Registry Supported by a National Public Bank http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager250.pdf

Day 2: 23 February 2016

SESSION 4: Brazil's Social Security Programmes—Contributory Pension System

Speaker: Mr. Marcelo Abi-Ramia Caetano, Coordinator of Social Security and Social Assistance Research, Ipea

Mr. Caetano's presentation featured very recent data to present the Brazilian pension system, constituted of compulsory contributions from formal workers from both the private and public sectors. He explained that the pension system's coverage in Brazil is inextricably related to the inequalities within the regions of the country, as the North and Northeast are the least economically developed regions and therefore have a smaller percentage of the population actively contributing to pension funds.

The presentation also touched on the institutional framework of contributory pensions in Brazil, characterising the role of the National Institute of Social Security (INSS) and its pension fund, the Length-of-Service Guarantee Fund (FGTS). Closing the presentation, a set of data and statistical analyses were used to demonstrate the impacts of the contributory social security system on poverty reduction among the elderly population (i.e. over 60 years old). Mr. Caetano then answered questions regarding the contribution levels of the pension, highlighting the challenges facing the financial sustainability of pension systems in countries with rapidly aging populations wsuch as Brazil and Uganda.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/Hvs0XTuLMJ96dt

Additional reading material:

One Pager: Possibilities and Limitations of the Expansion of Social Protection through Classic Contributory Schemes: Notes on the Social Security Inclusion of the Poor Working Population http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager237.pdf

Policy Brief: Poverty Profile: The Rural North and Northeast Regions of Brazil http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/TP15_Poverty_Profile_The_Rural_North_Northeast_Regions_Brazil.pdf

SESSION 5: Brazil's Social Security Programmes—Non-Contributory Pension System

Speaker: Mr. Rafael Osório, IPC-IG Research Coordinator and Ipea Representative

Mr. Osório presented the Brazilian non-contributory constitutional grant, Continued Payment Benefit (*Beneficio de Prestação Continuada*, BPC/LOAS), which entitles the elderly (over 65 years old) and people with physical or mental disabilities to a monthly cash transfer equal to the minimum wage. He emphasised that the BPC is a social right, guaranteed by the Brazilian Constitution, designed to benefit people living in poverty (defined by the BPC as those with a monthly income of up to a fourth of the minimum wage). The presentation detailed the BPC's institutional framework and its management by the Brazilian National Institute of Social Security (INSS). He also updated the participants on the most recent debates within the Brazilian Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger (MDS) about transferring the BPC to its purview.

Moreover, two particular issues related to the benefit were highlighted: i) the institutional challenge of reaching vulnerable populations living in remote areas of the country—as the disability assessments must be performed by INSS physicians who are not always available in remote areas; and ii) the amount of red tape and bureaucracy associated with the programme, as both the INSS and the Social Assistance Centres (CRAS) require the fulfilment of multiple forms and questionnaires. Mr. Osório also informed the participants of the inconsistences and difficulties faced by the Brazilian Government in delivering the benefit, as there are numerous individual cases whereby the eligibility criteria is contested and the benefit is disputed in legal courts.

Although the grant was created in 1988 with the new Brazilian Constitution, the payment of the benefits only started in 1996. Since the creation of the BPC predated the Single Registry, the Brazilian government is now facing difficulties in unifying the databases of both programmes. At the end of the presentation, the study tour participants mentioned some characteristics of Uganda's culture and economy, creating a distinct knowledge-sharing environment.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/Gotb0cCR99VhFG

Additional reading material:

One Pager: Conditional Cash Transfers and the Basic Income Grant in Brazil: Will They Ever Merge? http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager124.pdf

SESSION 6: Financing the Brazilian Social Protection System

Speaker: Mr. Rodrigo Orair, IPC-IG Research Associate and Ipea Researcher

Mr. Orair dynamically explained the redistributive role of social protection policies in Brazil, using examples plucked from the country's economic history to demonstrate that an increasing Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (such as experienced by Brazil during the 1970s) does not necessarily guarantee a reduction in inequality levels. Brazil's 1988 Constitution is especially relevant in this respect, for having established the institutional framework and budget for a social security system, laying the groundwork for an expansion of social rights. In addition, Mr. Orair briefly analysed Brazil's fiscal and monetary structures, including the Law of Fiscal Responsibility (2000), using tables and graphs to explain important indicators such as expenditures with social benefits, the number of beneficiaries of different programmes and the redistributive impact of fiscal policies in Latin American countries.

According to Mr. Orair, "social benefits are important to reduce income inequalities, but are not the main driver of change". The participants were interested in Brazil's experiences in reducing poverty and inequality. During the 2000s, the country experienced a combination of macroeconomic factors, such as a favourable external environment; more availability of credit consumption; a change in the fiscal regime leading to an expansion phase; and high labour market dynamism that endorsed a larger fiscal space, necessary for increasing the distribution of social benefits and public investments.

Mr. Kenneth Mugambe, from the Ugandan Ministry of Finance, pointed out that in Africa and in Latin America several governments are highly dependent on international resources to finance public expenditures, which both affects their financial stability and increases their external debt. In fact, most low- and middle-income countries are challenged by fiscal and financial uncertainty, which frequently stifles the expansion of social protection policies. However, Brazil's experience illustrates that developing economies are also capable of designing and implementing social protection policies, considering that sustainable growth is largely a result of converging economic, fiscal and political factors.

Finally, Mr. Orair emphasised the importance of widening the tax base, given the challenge of preserving all drivers for inclusive growth through the current scenario of financial crisis and fiscal adjustment in Brazil. According to the speaker, a reform towards a progressive tax system is a way forward, combining efficiency and equity.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/yS7WvhFWOdsyWQ>

Additional reading material:

Policy Brief: Fiscal Conditions of Brazil's Public Sector: an Analysis of the States in the North and Northeast Regions and Funding for Rural Development

http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/TP12_Fiscal_Conditions_Brazil_Public_Sector.pdf

One Pager: Fiscal Conditions of Brazil's Public Sector: an Analysis of the States in the North and Northeast Regions and Funding for Rural Development

http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/OP308_Fiscal_Conditions_Brazil_Public_Sector_Analysis_States_North_Northeast_Regions.pdf

Working Paper: Taxation and distribution of income in Brazil: new evidence from personal income tax data http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/WP136_Taxation_and_distribution_of_income_in_Brazil_new_evidence_from_personal_income_tax_data.pdf

One Pager: Taxation and distribution of income in Brazil: new evidence from personal income tax data http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/OP312_Taxation_and_Distribution_of_Income_in_Brazil_New_Evidence_from_Personal_Income_Tax_Data.pdf

EXTRA SESSION: socialprotection.org Presentation

Speakers: Ms. Alicia Spengler, IPC-IG Senior Project Analyst, and Ms. Raquel Tebaldi, Research Assistant

Alicia Spengler presented the socialprotection.org online platform to the visiting delegation. She highlighted that the platform, launched in September 2015, now features over 700 members from more than 100 countries, eight of whom are from Uganda—in their majority government officials. The platform already hosts 18 publications related to the country, and its potential for gathering more information about Uganda's Social Protection policies and experiences will increase as more members join the platform and contribute with country-related content such as news, events and various informative materials.

One of the most relevant contributions of socialprotection.org is its knowledge sharing tools, which include publications, webinars, online communities, specialised forums and events. Moreover, the platform is distinguished for its in-depth classification of social protection policies and programmes, along with a detailed description of relevant stakeholders and a range of publications related to the area—from academic research to official government reports.

Ms. Spengler also suggested that all Study Tour members and other government officials involved in the Uganda's social protection strategy could use the online community tool to foster their discussions regarding a post-tour action plan. The platform could be used to enhance inter-agency dialogue and as a mechanism to keep track of the group's next steps in applying the lessons learned from the Brazilian experience in social protection policies. In that case, the discussion could be developed within a closed community, whereby only approved members would be granted access. Accordingly, members could be ascribed a moderator role to stimulate the debate and help keep it on track. Subsequently, members could publish a final product/report, considering relevant assessments and conclusions.

Mr. Pius Bigirimana, head of the Ugandan delegation, added to the discussion stating that institutional coordination (within the country and among different stakeholders) is crucial for the success of the ESP Programme. In fact, different ministries and agencies were represented in the Study Tour: the Ministry of Gender Labour and Social Development; the Ministry of Finance, Planning and Economic Development; the Ministry of Health; the National Planning Authority; the Ministry of Local Government; the Office of the Prime Minister; DFID Uganda and Irish Aid Uganda.







The presentation ended with a practical demonstration of the platform by Ms. Raquel Tebaldi (IPC-IG Research Assistant) followed by a general invitation for all delegation members to join social protection.org and make full use of its knowledge sharing and knowledge production tools.

Link to the website: <www.socialprotection.org>

Day 3: 24 February 2016

SESSION 7: Brasil Sem Miséria (Brazil without Extreme Poverty—BSM) Programme: Overview and Interagency Coordination

Speaker: Ms. Raphaella Bandeira, Analyst for Social Policies, MDS

Ms. Bandeira's presentation focused on the Brazil without Extreme Poverty (*Brasil Sem Miséria*—BSM), the most recent national strategy that coordinates different social protection programmes geared towards reducing extreme poverty. Ms. Bandeira explained the main mechanisms of the BSM and its interagency coordination component. While most social protection policies overlap with the working areas of the MDS, the BSM also counts with the involvement of other ministries, including the Ministries of: Education; Health; Budget and Planning; Labour and Employment; Urban Development; Agrarian Development; etc., which is essential for reducing poverty and promoting inclusive growth. Ms. Bandeira also emphasised the importance of the Single Registry as a 'poverty map' that supports governmental actions to reach vulnerable families that do not have access to *Bolsa Família* or other social programmes. The 'Active Search of Beneficiaries' started in 2011 and strengthened local social assistance centres—working at the municipal level—to reach families that were not yet registered in the database. Moreover, BSM set the 'closing the extreme poverty gap' strategy in place, whereby the *Bolsa Família* programme was adapted to account for different monthly *per capita* incomes of different beneficiary families.

In summary, the BSM plan is composed of three main components. i) cash transfers; ii) rural and urban productive inclusion; and iii) access to public services. Ms. Bandeira outlined each area, focusing on the institutional framework for the coordination of all programmes across different decision-making levels. At the end of the presentation, the Ugandan delegation raised questions regarding the policy's implementation, more specifically about the mechanisms used by the government to ensure accountability in its national programmes. This fuelled a lively debate, complemented by a practical presentation of the Brazilian Transparency Gateway website (*Portal da Transparência*), which gathers information regarding public expenses.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/1SFgiFlgQOiqEr

Additional reading material:

One Pager: New Strategy for Poverty Eradication in Brazil: the Emergence of the *Brasil Sem Miséria* Plan http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager214.pdf>

One Pager: Brazil without Extreme Poverty: New Perspectives for Brazilian Social Protection Policy Research Brief: Bolsa Família after Brasil Carinhoso: an Analysis of the Potential for Reducing Extreme Poverty http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/OP301_Brazil_without_Extreme_Poverty_New_Perspectives_for_Brazilian_Social_Protection.pdf

SESSION 8: BSM Programme: the strategy for fighting rural poverty through institutional food procurement and subsidies targeted at smallholder farmers

Speaker: Mr. Fábio Veras

Mr. Veras' presentation focused on the Brazilian experience in mitigating rural poverty, outlining the different national policies that contribute towards promoting food security in rural areas (mainly in the North and Northeast regions of Brazil). Mr. Veras presented a general background and data on hunger and rural poverty in Brazil, pointing out the main programmes in place to tackle these problems, starting with the creation of the National Programme for the Strengthening of Family Farming (*Programa Nacional de Fortalecimento da Agricultura Familiar*—PRONAF) to provide subsidised credit to family farmers in the 1990s. Furthermore, Mr. Veras emphasised the main mechanisms of two recent programmes in Brazil: the Food Acquisition Programme (*Programa de Aquisição de Alimentos*—PAA) and the National School Feeding Programme (*Programa Nacional de Alimentação Escolar*—PNAE), both of which promote institutional demand and procurement for family farmers in Brazil, providing a direct connection between the production of family farming and national school feeding programmes. The PAA acts on both the supply and demand sides: it prioritises

socially vulnerable family farmers, providing them with an institutional market, and also benefits institutions that provide social assistance—especially schools, food banks, subsidised restaurants (known as 'restaurantes populares', i.e. popular restaurants) and community kitchens.

The speaker presented the legal and institutional frameworks for PAA and PNAE, referring to evidence gleaned from recent research to highlight their impacts and overall achievements in the reduction of rural poverty and in achieving rural productive inclusion. Challenges remain for the full development of institutional markets linked to family farming in Brazil. Mr. Veras highlighted the importance for local governments to closely engage with local civil society to access socially vulnerable family. He also mentioned the importance of adapting extension services to the context of local populations, such as language and training materials for beneficiaries with low levels of education, crucial to the full implementation of social protection programmes in Brazil as well as in other developing countries.

Link to the presentation on PAA and PNAE: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/rtTtyvxPj1IZAU

Link to the presentation on rural poverty: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/qrz520loRHpz8y

Additional reading material:

Working Paper: Scale of Institutional Public Procurement of Food in Brazil http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/WP134_Scale_of_Institutional_Public_Procurement_of_Food_in_Brazil.pdf

One Pager: Scale of Public Procurement of Food and its Implications for Promoting Inclusive Agricultural Growth http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/OP305_Scale_of_Public_Procurement_of_Food_and_its_Implications_for_Promoting_Inclusive_Agricultural_Growth.pdf

Policy Brief: Public Policies for Rural Areas and the Fight against Rural Poverty in the North and Northeast Regions of Brazil: a Look at the Fish, the Fishing Rod and the River http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/TP14_Public_Policies_for_Rural_Areas.pdf

SESSION 9: BSM Programme: the strategy for fighting urban poverty, providing vocational education and training (VET)

Speaker: Mr. Marcelo Sousa

In this session, Mr. de Sousa talked about relevant experiences in urban productive inclusion, especially the Vocational Education and Training (VET), a component of the BSM strategy.

Since the early 20th century, Brazil's economy has been characterised by high rates of unemployment and informality—a direct consequence of social inequality and relatively low levels of professional qualification. As a result, the creation of institutional programmes providing professional and technical training was of paramount importance to the country's productive inclusion strategy in recent years.

The participants of the study tour learnt about the institutional framework that supports the implementation of professional qualification programmes in Brazil, especially the National System of Industrial Training (SENAI) and the National System of Commercial Training (SENAC), both certified by the Brazilian Ministry of Education. Mr. Sousa also detailed the main structure of the National Programme for Access to Technical Education and Employment (PRONATEC), created in 2011 to provide technical qualification and training for low-income people. Finally, the presenter gave a critical evaluation of the programme's outputs, pointing out its key strengths and persisting challenges, such as a strong demand among beneficiaries of social policies (such as *Bolsa Família*), and the failings in helping beneficiaries reach the formal labour market.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/7ocrFaDeQ7x5G9

Additional reading material:

One Pager: Professional Qualification in the Urban Productive Inclusion Strategy of *Plano Brasil Sem Miséria* http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager254.pdf>

Policy in Focus: Youth and Employment among the BRICS, particularly two articles on Brazil: "A Brief Overview of Youth Turnover in the Brazilian Formal Labour Market" (p.10) and "Youth and Employment: A Contribution to the Dialogue on Public Policy" (p.12)

http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCPovertyInFocus28.pdf







Day 4: 25 February 2016

SESSION 10: BSM Programme: Coordination among social assistance, education and health policies

Speaker: Mr. Daniel Ximenes (DEB/CAPES)

Mr. Ximenes focused on two relevant features of the Brazilian social protection system: compliance with conditionalities in the *Bolsa Família* Programme (PBF) and the access to public services and social assistance. Conditional cash transfers (CCTs) such as the PBF depend mainly on two factors: the government's extension of access to basic services in health, education and social assistance, and compliance with the conditionalities aimed at the formation of human capital among beneficiary families.

As mentioned in previous sessions, the 1988 Brazilian Constitution instituted the universal coverage of health and education systems in the country. However, deficiencies in the supply of public services remained a problem for many people living in the poorest regions of the country (mainly in rural areas), where most of the beneficiaries of the PBF are located. In fact, the effective implementation of CCTs relies on the provision of public services to vulnerable families, as the programme's main objective is to break the intergenerational cycle of poverty by providing incentives to provide children with regular health check-ups and keep them enrolled in school. In Brazil, there is concrete evidence that CCTs are effective in increasing enrolment rates, improving preventive health care, and raising household consumption.

It is important to monitor conditionalities in the PBF to identify vulnerable families, who might be facing difficulties in accessing health and education services¹. Moreover, it would be an institutional opportunity to build up a multi-sectorial collaboration strategy, since poverty is a multidimensional problem that must be addressed by different government agencies. Currently, Brazil relies on the Conditionality System of the *Bolsa Familia* Programme (SICON), which ensures that public officers can verify compliance with conditionalities and identify families that are not following the government's recommendations regarding education and health. Under the PBF, families must comply with minimum school attendance rates of 85 per cent for children between 6 and 15 years old, and 75 per cent for adolescents between 16 and 17 years old. Regarding health-related conditionalities, beneficiaries must follow nutrition monitoring for pregnant and nursing women as well as for children up to 7 years old, and provide pre- and post-natal immunisation records for children of up to 7 years old.

Participants asked questions concerning the gender implications of CCTs, the policy's impacts on school dropout rates and the monitoring mechanisms to ensure data is always updated. The questions stimulated a dynamic discussion on the effectiveness of monitoring tools, the importance of other sources of information for complementing data from the monitoring system (such as the annual school census and other surveys from the Ministries of Education and Health), and the forthcoming challenges related to promoting data integration and policy coordination in fighting poverty and inequality.

In Brazil, the MDS has been empowered by the Presidency of the Republic to coordinate multi-sectorial activities, supported by municipal administrators of the PBF that work at the local level. Finally, Mr. Ximenes offered four main recommendations for the development of cross-sectorial programmes: i) ensure a high level of policy institutionalisation; ii) elect a ministry/government department to be responsible for ensuring coordination among different agencies; iii) establish a common agenda and shared responsibilities; and iv) create a common working plan for all relevant agencies.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/FRwO8Q5d85lcr7

Additional reading material:

Working Paper: The Impact of the Programa Bolsa Família on Grade Repetition: Results from the Single Registry,

^{1.} Word Without Poverty. Results of monitoring the Bolsa Família conditionalities.

Attendance Project and School Census http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCWorkingPaper119.pdf>

One Pager: The Impact of the Programa *Bolsa Família* on Grade Repetition: Results from the Single Registry, Attendance Project and School Census

http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager233.pdf

One Pager: Combining Conditional Cash Transfers and Primary Health Care to Reduce Childhood Mortality in Brazil http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager242.pdf

One Pager: Conditionalities, School Performance and Progression of *Bolsa Família* Programme Recipients http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager241.pdf>

One Pager: What Is the Impact of the *Bolsa Família* Programme on Education? http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager107.pdf>

One Pager: The conditions for conditionality in cash transfers http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/OP317_The_conditions_for_conditionality_in_cash_transfers.pdf

SESSION 11: BSM Programme: targeted conditional cash transfers, Bolsa Família in depth

Speaker: Mr. Luis Henrique Paiva, IPC-IG Research Associate and Ipea Researcher

Mr. Paiva promoted an in-depth discussion about the institutional and legal backgrounds of conditional cash transfers in Brazil, more specifically the *Bolsa Família* Programme (PBF). Although the PBF had been previously discussed in other sessions, the speaker complemented their main lessons by focusing on the complexities related to the implementation of the main cash transfer programme in Brazil. Since 2003, the PBF has been expanding gradually, from 3 million beneficiary families in 2003 to 14 million in 2014. The programme is currently one of the largest social protections policies in Latin America, along with *Prospera* in Mexico. Also, the PBF has had an important role as a 'driving force' for the vertical and horizontal integration of social policies in Brazil, unifying cash transfer programmes across different levels of government and linking conditional cash transfers with complementary actions and services in all areas of the government.

The speaker also focused on the institutional and legal backgrounds of *Bolsa Família*, its targeting mechanisms and the effectiveness of using self-declared income to identify beneficiaries. The presentation also detailed the financial benefits to which different families are entitled, emphasising the importance of considering the household (and not the individual) with its targeting system. The PBF is implemented over a decentralised base, whereby the federal government, states and individual municipalities share responsibilities regarding implementation, the monitoring of transfers and compliance with conditionalities. While the MDS promotes training and financial support for the programme's implementation at the regional and local levels, state and local governments are responsible for guaranteeing access to public health and education services and for identifying and registering vulnerable families in the Single Registry.

Finally, the presenter emphasised the remaining challenges for the programme's effectiveness, such as the importance to shift it from a 'government policy' to a 'state policy', which would increase the likelihood of its continuity and make it more resilient to budget cuts.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/3BEXzW1qzXy3LG

Additional reading material:

Working Paper: Targeting and Coverage of the *Bolsa Família* Programme: Why Knowing What You Measure Is Important In Choosing the Numbers

http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCWorkingPaper71.pdf

One Pager: Targeting and Coverage of the *Bolsa Família* Programme: What Is the Meaning of Eleven Million Families? http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager117.pdf>

Policy in Focus: Social Protection, Entrepreneurship and Labour Market Activation – article "The *Bolsa Família* Programme: Distribution and Growth" (p. 22)

http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/PIF32 Social Protection Entrepreneurship and Labour Market Activation.pdf>

Policy in Focus: Is there a Brazilian model of development? http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/PIF33_ls_there_a_Brazilian_model_of_development.pdf

SESSION 12: BSM Programme—Interagency coordination with the Minha Casa, Minha Vida housing programme (MCMV)

Speaker: Mr. Pedro de Arruda, IPC-IG Research Associate

Mr. de Arruda presented Brazil's most recent developments in social housing policies, especially the *Minha Casa Minha Vida* programme (MCMV), which targets low- and middle-income families living in both urban and rural areas.

The presentation provided an in-depth explanation of the MCMV programme, focusing on its institutional mechanisms, targeting systems and financial structure. In summary, the programme targets three potential beneficiary groups, each with different maximum family income levels. Most beneficiaries belong to 'group 1', receiving subsidies for the acquisition of housing units without the need for prior credit analysis.

Furthermore, Mr. Arruda explained the policy implementation, giving a detailed description of each phase of the programme, from contracting and ensuring technical details, to selecting the programme's beneficiaries, in a process that comprises minimum selection criteria from both the Brazilian central government and from municipal and state level administrators. The programme is under the responsibility of Caixa Econômica Federal (CEF), a Brazilian federal bank that manages loans and subsidies for all targeted groups and contracts the construction of housing units for group 1. All information from potential beneficiaries are cross-referenced against other databases, especially the Single Registry, the Length-of-Service Guarantee Fund (FGTS) and the Annual Social Information Report (*Relação Anual de Informações Sociais*—RAIS), ensuring a good proxy for formal labour and income information.

Finally, the speaker presented recent data on the number of social housing units already built and the projection for the coming years, highlighting that the number of contracts exceeds the number of houses already built and delivered, which ensures the programme's continuity during the next year. However, recent constrains in the Federal Government's budget has put the programme at risk. Mr. Arruda ended his presentation by pointing out the main challenges and lessons learned from the programme's implementation, aiming at encouraging a critical discussion on how to foster social inclusion in coordination with social housing programmes.

Link to the presentation: https://pt.slideshare.net/secret/4iviJ4JSEA2j6K

Day 5: 26 February, 2016

Field Visit to a Social Assistance Reference Centre (CRAS) and a Specialised Social Assistance Reference Centre (CREAS), located in Ceilândia

In Brazil, all social assistance initiatives are unified through the Unified Social Assistance System (SUAS) and regulated by a Federal Law enacted in 1993. The system establishes the organisation of social assistance across two levels: basic social protection and specialised social protection, which is further subdivided into medium and high complexity.

Basic social protection comprises the set of services, programmes, projects and benefits aimed at preventing vulnerability, social risk and the violation of rights, through the development of capabilities and acquisitions and the strengthening of family and community ties. The Social Assistance Reference Centre (CRAS) is responsible for offering these services and acts as the main point of entry for beneficiaries to reach the SUAS. The main service offered by CRAS is the Full Protection and Support Service to Families (PAIF).

The specialised social protection service comprises the set of services, programmes, projects and benefits aimed at contributing to restoring family and community ties, the strengthening and protection of families undergoing some sort of violation of rights, such as: physical and/or emotional abuse, negligence, sexual violence (abuse and/or sexual exploitation), teenagers complying with correctional socio-educational or protective measures, human trafficking, homelessness, abandonment, child labour, discrimination, among others. Specialised social protection is further subdivided into two complexity levels: medium complexity—with services offered by the Specialised Social Assistance Reference Centre (CREAS); and high complexity—whereby care is provided by shelters.

Ceilândia, Distrito Federal (DF) - The Federal District (DF) is one of the 27 federal units of Brazil. Unlike other states in the country, it is not subdivided into municipalities, but rather into 31 Administrative Regions.

Ceilândia is Administrative Region number IX (RA-IX), located 26km away from Brasília. It has an estimated urban population of 490,000. Regarding average schooling rates, 35.96 per cent of the population have not completed primary education, 23.94 per cent have completed secondary education and 6.02 per cent have completed tertiary education. Household income is considered low at a monthly BRL3432, with an average monthly per capita income of BRL1020.

Additional reading material:

Working Paper: The Consolidation of Social Assistance in Brazil and Its Challenges, 1988–2008 http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCWorkingPaper76.pdf>

One Pager: The Consolidation of Social Assistance Policy in Brazil http://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/IPCOnePager122.pdf>

CREDITS

This document was jointly prepared by the IPC-IG's Communications and Publications Departments for the visiting delegation of the Republic of Uganda in March 2016.

Research Coordinators: Diana Sawyer, Fábio Veras Soares, Luis Henrique Paiva and Rafael Guerreiro Osório

Communications Officer: Denise Marinho dos Santos

Communications Assistant: Cecilia Amaral

Research Intern: Anna Carolina Machado Maciel da Silva

Publications Manager: Roberto Astorino

Editorial Clerk: Manoel Salles

Desktop Publishing Assistants: Flávia Amaral and Rosa Maria Banuth

Executive Assistant: Isadora Ruotolo



International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth

United Nations Development Programme

SBS, Quadra 1, Bloco J, Ed. BNDES, 13° andar 70076-900 Brasília, DF - Brazil Telephone: +55 61 2105 5000

publications@ipc-undp.org • www.ipc.undp.org